Tax Reform: Repealing State and Local Income Tax + Property Tax Deductibility

Winners / Losers

August 2017

Conclusions and Methodology

Conclusions:

- When combined with lower individual income tax rates and an increase in the standard deduction, repealing the tax deductibility of State and Local Income and Real Estate taxes (collectively = SALT) would likely result in:
 - Winners: Generally, taxpayers with incomes of less than ~\$1mm (~99.7% of filers) would likely pay less tax. Even high income itemizers in 7 states would likely benefit. Lower rates and an increased standard deduction make up for the loss of SALT deductibility
 - Most positively impacted states: Alaska, Texas, Tennessee, South Dakota, Alabama
 - Losers: Generally, only the highest earning taxpayers with incomes of \$1mm+ (~0.3% of filers) in 43 states would likely pay more tax. Losers could potentially be overstated, however, as SALT payments are not deductible against the individual alternative minimum tax (AMT), which is prevalent in high-income states, and the Pease limitation on itemized deductions would likely be more than offset by the benefit of the rate reduction for the highest earners
 - Most negatively impacted states: New York, California, Connecticut, Minnesota, New Jersey

Methodology:

- Data is individual income tax return data from the IRS Statistics of Income Historic Table 2 State Data Tax Year 2014 (most recent year available)
- Excluded returns with no Adjusted Gross Income (AGI) stub, with income under \$1, and returns from the District of Columbia
- The remaining returns were bucketed by range and size of AGI
- The report only looks at today's itemizers. Today's non-itemizers are clear winners going forward due to higher standard deduction and potentially lower rate¹
- For buckets with AGI of ~\$500k and greater, assumed the Pease limitation reduced the amount of itemized deductions by 3% of the amount of AGI exceeding ~\$300k, which was the 2014 income threshold for filers with status of married filing jointly (status of ~85% of filers in respective buckets)
- The value of the tax rate on AGI, SALT, and Other itemized deductions was calculated using estimated 2014 tax rates
- Assumed filers lose the ability to deduct SALT from their AGI and retain the ability to deduct Other itemized deductions
- For itemizers in each bucket, assumed they would choose to deduct the greater of Other itemized deductions or the estimated weighted average of the new larger standard deduction, which was calculated based on amounts in the GOP Blueprint and the filing status of each bracket's returns
- After determining whether taxpayers would continue to itemize or take the estimated weighted average of the new larger standard deduction, economic impacts were determined. Under the tax reform scenario, the value of the tax rate on AGI and deductions was calculated using tax rates from the GOP Blueprint and a rate of 35% for taxpayers in the 39.6% bracket. The status quo value of the estimated 2014 tax rates on AGI and deductions was then subtracted to determine whether a taxpayer would experience a gain or loss in value
- The process was repeated to determine Winners and Losers among states with itemizers in the highest income bracket assuming an AGI of \$1mm

Value Gain/Loss from Repeal of SALT Deductibility + Lower Rate + Larger Standard Deduction by Income Bracket

Key takeaways:

- In general, nearly all filers (~99.7%) would likely benefit from a lower rate and increased standard deduction notwithstanding the loss of SALT
- Highest income bracket comprising ~0.3% of the total number of individual income tax returns would likely pay more
 taxes, though the degree to which they would depends on interactions between the upper ends of AGI, AMT, and the
 Pease limitation
- Despite a lower rate and increased standard deduction, taxpayers with incomes of \$1MM+ (~0.8% of itemizers) would likely continue to itemize
- Incomes greater than ~\$200k: ~80%+ are itemizers
- Incomes greater than ~\$500k: ~90%+ are itemizers

						Status Quo			Tax Reform				
											(D)		
					Individual						Value of Max		
					Income Tax						of Avg. Other		
				Individual	Returns w/						Itemized Ded.		
	Individual	% of Total	Cumulative	Income Tax	Itemized		(A)	(B)		(C)	or Est. Wtd.	(C+D)-(A+B)	
	Income	Individual	% of Total	Returns w/	Deductions as		Value of Tax	Value of		Value of Tax	Avg. of New	Value Gain or	
High-end of	Tax	Income	Individual	Itemized	% of AGI		Rate on AGI	Deductions		Rate on AGI	Std. Deduction	(Loss) per	Will
AGI Income	Returns	Tax	Income Tax	Deductions	Income Bracket	Est. Tax	per Itemized	per Itemized	Est. Tax	per Itemized	per Itemized	Itemized	Continue to
Bracket (\$)	(MM)	Returns	Returns	(MM)	Returns	Rate (%)	Return (\$)	Return (\$)	Rate (%)	Return (\$)	Return (\$)	Return (\$)*	Itemize?
\$9,999	21.9	15.1%	15.1%	0.7	3.4%	10.0%	(\$1,000)	\$1,539	10%	(\$1,000)	\$1,342	-	No
\$24,999	33.1	22.8%	38.0%	2.4	7.3%	15.0%	(\$3,750)	\$2,255	12%	(\$3,000)	\$1,820	\$315	No
\$49,999	34.2	23.7%	61.6%	6.8	19.8%	15.0%	(\$7,500)	\$2,325	12%	(\$6,000)	\$1,937	\$1,112	No
\$74,999	19.5	13.5%	75.1%	7.7	39.6%	25.0%	(\$18,750)	\$4,367	25%	(\$18,750)	\$4,512	\$145	No
\$99,999	12.6	8.7%	83.8%	6.9	55.2%	25.0%	(\$25,000)	\$4,971	25%	(\$25,000)	\$5,058	\$87	No
\$199,999	17.3	12.0%	95.7%	13.3	77.0%	28.0%	(\$56,000)	\$7,033	25%	(\$50,000)	\$5,439	\$4,406	No
\$499,999	5.0	3.4%	99.2%	4.6	93.6%	39.6%	(\$198,000)	\$14,515	35%	(\$175,000)	\$7,809	\$16,294	No
\$999,999	0.8	0.5%	99.7%	0.7	93.4%	39.6%	(\$396,000)	\$24,766	35%	(\$350,000)	\$7,790	\$29,024	No
\$1,000,000	0.4	0.3%	100.0%	0.4	91.5%	39.6%	(\$396,000)	\$159,610	35%	(\$350,000)	\$51,146	(\$62,465)	Yes

^{*}Per GOP Blueprint, taxpayers who are currently in the 10% bracket always will pay lower taxes than under current law.

<u>Winners</u>: States with Value Gain from Repeal of SALT <u>Deductibility + Lower Rate</u>

Key takeaways:

• Even the high income itemizers (only $\sim 0.03\%$ of the total number of individual income tax filers) in 7 states would likely pay <u>less</u> taxes

			Status	Quo			Tax Reform			
		Value of Avg.	Value of Avg.		(A)			(B)		
	Itemized	SALT	Other Itemized		Value of	Value of Avg.		Value of		
	Returns with	Deductions at	Deductions at	Value of Tax	Deductions +	Other Itemized	Value of Tax	Deductions +	(B-A)	
	Income \$1MM+	Tax Rate of	Tax Rate of	Rate of 39.6%	Value of Tax	Deductions at	Rate of 35%	Value of Tax	Value Gain or	Value
	as % of Total	39.6% per	39.6% per	on AGI per	Rate per	Tax Rate of 35%	on AGI per	Rate per	(Loss) per	Gain or
	State Income	Itemized Return	Itemized	Itemized	Itemized	per Itemized	Itemized	Itemized	Itemized	(Loss) %
State	Tax Returns	(\$000s)	Return (\$000s)	Return (\$000s)	Return (\$000s)	Return (\$000s)	Return (\$000s)	Return (\$000s)	Return (\$000s)	of AGI
AK	0.1%	\$9.8	\$35.6	(\$396.0)	(\$350.6)	\$27.8	(\$350.0)	(\$322.2)	\$28.4	2.8%
TX	0.2%	\$19.3	\$90.0	(\$396.0)	(\$286.8)	\$75.9	(\$350.0)	(\$274.1)	\$12.6	1.3%
TN	0.1%	\$26.1	\$84.9	(\$396.0)	(\$285.0)	\$71.4	(\$350.0)	(\$278.6)	\$6.4	0.6%
SD	0.2%	\$20.6	\$146.1	(\$396.0)	(\$229.3)	\$125.5	(\$350.0)	(\$224.5)	\$4.8	0.5%
AL	0.1%	\$34.5	\$51.4	(\$396.0)	(\$310.1)	\$41.8	(\$350.0)	(\$308.2)	\$1.9	0.2%
ND	0.3%	\$37.4	\$33.5	(\$396.0)	(\$325.1)	\$25.9	(\$350.0)	(\$324.1)	\$1.0	0.1%
WA	0.2%	\$22.4	\$165.1	(\$396.0)	(\$208.4)	\$142.3	(\$350.0)	(\$207.7)	\$0.7	0.1%

<u>Losers</u>: States with Value Loss from Repeal of SALT <u>Deductibility + Lower Rate</u>

Key takeaways:

- High income itemizers (comprising ~0.3% of the total number of individual income tax filers) in 43 states would likely pay more taxes
- The penalty ranges from ~0.1% of AGI (Louisiana) to ~15.3% of AGI (New York)

			Status	Quo			Tax Reform			
State	Itemized Returns with Income \$1MM+ as % of Total State Income Tax Returns	Value of Avg. SALT Deductions at Tax Rate of 39.6% per Itemized Return (\$000s)	Value of Avg. Other Itemized Deductions at Tax Rate of 39.6% per Itemized Return (\$000s)	Value of Tax Rate of 39.6% on AGI per Itemized Return (\$000s)	(A) Value of Deductions + Value of Tax Rate per Itemized Return (\$000s)	Value of Avg. Other Itemized Deductions at Tax Rate of 35% per Itemized Return (\$000s)	Rate of 35%	(B) Value of Deductions + Value of Tax Rate per Itemized Return (\$000s)	(B-A) Value Gain or (Loss) per Itemized Return (\$000s)	Value Gain or (Loss) % of AGI
NY	0.5%	\$185.9	\$78.6	(\$396.0)	(\$131.5)	\$65.8	(\$350.0)	(\$284.2)	(\$152.7)	-15.3%
CA	0.4%	\$168.8	\$63.9	(\$396.0)	(\$163.3)	\$52.8	(\$350.0)	(\$297.2)	(\$133.9)	-13.4%
СТ	0.6%	\$125.6	\$50.6	(\$396.0)	(\$219.8)	\$41.1	(\$350.0)	(\$308.9)	(\$89.1)	-8.9%
MN	0.2%	\$108.7	\$37.1	(\$396.0)	(\$250.2)	\$29.2	(\$350.0)	(\$320.8)	(\$70.7)	-7.1%
NJ	0.4%	\$108.3	\$15.4	(\$396.0)	(\$272.3)	\$10.0	(\$350.0)	(\$340.0)	(\$67.7)	-6.8%
HI	0.1%	\$96.8	\$46.9	(\$396.0)	(\$252.3)	\$37.8	(\$350.0)	(\$312.2)	(\$59.9)	-6.0%
OR	0.2%	\$93.3	\$73.1	(\$396.0)	(\$229.6)	\$61.0	(\$350.0)	(\$289.0)	(\$59.4)	-5.9%
MD	0.3%	\$93.8	\$39.7	(\$396.0)	(\$262.5)	\$31.4	(\$350.0)	(\$318.6)	(\$56.1)	-5.6%
MA	0.4%	\$87.4	\$60.1	(\$396.0)	(\$248.5)	\$49.5	(\$350.0)	(\$300.5)	(\$52.0)	-5.2%
VT	0.2%	\$88.9	\$46.7	(\$396.0)	(\$260.4)	\$37.7	(\$350.0)	(\$312.3)	(\$52.0)	-5.2%
RI	0.2%	\$89.4	\$34.0	(\$396.0)	(\$272.6)	\$26.4	(\$350.0)	(\$323.6)	(\$51.0)	-5.1%
WI	0.2%	\$82.1	\$47.0	(\$396.0)	(\$266.9)	\$37.9	(\$350.0)	(\$312.1)	(\$45.2)	-4.5%
MO	0.2%	\$79.7	\$63.4	(\$396.0)	(\$252.9)	\$52.4	(\$350.0)	(\$297.6)	(\$44.7)	-4.5%
AR	0.1%	\$78.5	\$65.7	(\$396.0)	(\$251.7)	\$54.4	(\$350.0)	(\$295.6)	(\$43.8)	-4.4%
WY	0.2%	\$48.7	\$303.1	(\$396.0)	(\$44.2)	\$264.2	(\$350.0)	(\$85.8)	(\$41.6)	-4.2%
MT	0.2%	\$72.1	\$69.1	(\$396.0)	(\$254.8)	\$57.4	(\$350.0)	(\$292.6)	(\$37.7)	-3.8%
ID	0.1%	\$73.3	\$36.5	(\$396.0)	(\$286.2)	\$28.6	(\$350.0)	(\$321.4)	(\$35.2)	-3.5%
IL	0.3%	\$71.6	\$45.7	(\$396.0)	(\$278.7)	\$36.8	(\$350.0)	(\$313.2)	(\$34.6)	-3.5%
NV	0.2%	\$56.4	\$176.7	(\$396.0)	(\$162.9)	\$152.6	(\$350.0)	(\$197.4)	(\$34.5)	-3.5%
NE	0.2%	\$70.3	\$52.9	(\$396.0)	(\$272.8)	\$43.1	(\$350.0)	(\$306.9)	(\$34.1)	-3.4%
ME	0.1%	\$70.0	\$26.3	(\$396.0)	(\$299.7)	\$19.6	(\$350.0)	(\$330.4)	(\$30.7)	-3.1%

<u>Losers</u>: States with Value Loss from Repeal of SALT <u>Deductibility + Lower Rate (continued)</u>

			Status	Quo			Tax Reform			
State	Itemized Returns with Income \$1MM+ as % of Total State Income Tax Returns	Value of Avg. SALT Deductions at Tax Rate of 39.6% per Itemized Return (\$000s)	Value of Avg. Other Itemized Deductions at Tax Rate of 39.6% per Itemized Return (\$000s)	Value of Tax Rate of 39.6% on AGI per Itemized Return (\$000s)	(A) Value of Deductions + Value of Tax Rate per Itemized Return (\$000s)	Value of Avg. Other Itemized Deductions at Tax Rate of 35% per Itemized Return (\$000s)	Value of Tax Rate of 35% on AGI per Itemized Return (\$000s)	(B) Value of Deductions + Value of Tax Rate per Itemized Return (\$000s)	(B-A) Value Gain or (Loss) per Itemized Return (\$000s)	Value Gain or (Loss) % of AGI
VA	0.2%	\$66.5	\$39.3	(\$396.0)	(\$290.1)	\$31.1	(\$350.0)	(\$318.9)	(\$28.8)	-2.9%
NC	0.2%	\$65.2	\$47.8	(\$396.0)	(\$283.0)	\$38.6	(\$350.0)	(\$311.4)	(\$28.4)	-2.8%
UT	0.2%	\$61.8	\$75.9	(\$396.0)	(\$258.3)	\$63.4	(\$350.0)	(\$286.6)	(\$28.3)	-2.8%
KS	0.2%	\$61.0	\$76.0	(\$396.0)	(\$259.0)	\$63.5	(\$350.0)	(\$286.5)	(\$27.5)	-2.8%
GA	0.2%	\$61.5	\$70.1	(\$396.0)	(\$264.4)	\$58.3	(\$350.0)	(\$291.7)	(\$27.3)	-2.7%
WV	0.1%	\$67.5	\$14.9	(\$396.0)	(\$313.6)	\$9.5	(\$350.0)	(\$340.5)	(\$26.9)	-2.7%
ОН	0.2%	\$65.3	\$29.9	(\$396.0)	(\$300.8)	\$22.8	(\$350.0)	(\$327.2)	(\$26.4)	-2.6%
DE	0.2%	\$63.9	\$38.2	(\$396.0)	(\$293.9)	\$30.1	(\$350.0)	(\$319.9)	(\$26.0)	-2.6%
KY	0.1%	\$62.5	\$34.1	(\$396.0)	(\$299.4)	\$26.5	(\$350.0)	(\$323.5)	(\$24.1)	-2.4%
CO	0.3%	\$59.6	\$49.6	(\$396.0)	(\$286.8)	\$40.2	(\$350.0)	(\$309.8)	(\$23.0)	-2.3%
AZ	0.2%	\$53.7	\$59.2	(\$396.0)	(\$283.1)	\$48.7	(\$350.0)	(\$301.3)	(\$18.2)	-1.8%
OK	0.2%	\$45.5	\$112.8	(\$396.0)	(\$237.8)	\$96.0	(\$350.0)	(\$254.0)	(\$16.2)	-1.6%
MI	0.2%	\$53.4	\$31.3	(\$396.0)	(\$311.3)	\$24.0	(\$350.0)	(\$326.0)	(\$14.7)	-1.5%
PA	0.2%	\$52.1	\$38.7	(\$396.0)	(\$305.3)	\$30.6	(\$350.0)	(\$319.4)	(\$14.2)	-1.4%
IA	0.1%	\$52.4	\$32.5	(\$396.0)	(\$311.0)	\$25.1	(\$350.0)	(\$324.9)	(\$13.9)	-1.4%
IN	0.1%	\$52.2	\$32.4	(\$396.0)	(\$311.5)	\$25.0	(\$350.0)	(\$325.0)	(\$13.6)	-1.4%
SC	0.1%	\$49.4	\$36.5	(\$396.0)	(\$310.1)	\$28.7	(\$350.0)	(\$321.3)	(\$11.3)	-1.1%
NH	0.2%	\$46.6	\$59.4	(\$396.0)	(\$289.9)	\$48.9	(\$350.0)	(\$301.1)	(\$11.2)	-1.1%
FL	0.3%	\$43.6	\$83.9	(\$396.0)	(\$268.5)	\$70.5	(\$350.0)	(\$279.5)	(\$11.0)	-1.1%
NM	0.1%	\$48.9	\$38.0	(\$396.0)	(\$309.1)	\$29.9	(\$350.0)	(\$320.1)	(\$10.9)	-1.1%
MS	0.1%	\$43.3	\$40.4	(\$396.0)	(\$312.3)	\$32.1	(\$350.0)	(\$317.9)	(\$5.6)	-0.6%
LA	0.2%	\$38.9	\$38.1	(\$396.0)	(\$319.0)	\$30.0	(\$350.0)	(\$320.0)	(\$1.0)	-0.1%